Non-Academic and Support Unit Review Summaries

UNIT NAME:

Auxiliary and Business Services

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

Auxiliary and Business Services ("ABS") provides key services essential to the mission of the University: maintaining our facilities, roads, grounds and other infrastructure; environmental health and safety; procurement; parking; transportation; and sustainability.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

ABS has a total of 674 full-time employees for Fiscal Year 2024 ("FY2024"). From FY2018 to FY2024, ABS reduced its total headcount from 752 to 674 people, a reduction of 10%.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

ABS has a budget of approximately \$51.5 million for Fiscal Year 2024 ("FY2024"). From FY2018 to FY2024, ABS reduced the operating budget from \$56.7 million to \$51.2 million, which is a reduction of approximately 10%.

Additionally, more than \$1.6 million in wage increases were provided in 2021 and 2022 to the lowest earners within ABS, as the University moved the entry pay rate from \$10.20 to its current rate of \$13 per hour. Had these increases not been provided, the overall ABS budget reduction would have been nearly 13% instead of 10%. In sum, it will be difficult for the ABS team to maintain the same level of customer service with any additional budget reductions.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

ABS conducted a "spans and layers" review of its organization in spring 2023 to determine the depth of layers in the organization from President Gee through entry-level workers. ABS's organization has no more than 6 total layers in any of its units (President Gee being the first layer and entry-level being the last layer), which meets the standards set by Bain & Company and McKinsey & Company for an agile unit. Additionally, ABS examined the number of direct and indirect reports of its senior leaders to ensure an appropriate span of control. On average, each unit leader has: (1) 4 direct reports, meeting McKinsey's standard of three to five direct reports in a player/coach managerial span, and (2) 96 total reports.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

View the review outcome for Auxiliary and Business Services sub-units below.

Facilities (General University and Health Sciences)

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The University Facilities Management Team ("Facilities") is responsible for managing and enhancing our campus's physical environment, including maintaining and repairing facilities and infrastructure; maintaining and upgrading roads and grounds; cleaning facilities; responding to critical needs; and participating in campus event set-up.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

Facilities has a current FTE count of 499 FTEs, down 15% from FY2018 when there were 587 FTEs.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

From a salary and wage perspective, the overall Facilities budget has declined 17% from \$21.2 million in FY2018 to \$17.6 million in FY2024. 12 FTEs and \$594,000 of the foregoing decreases were due to warehouse services and ABS systems moving to Procurement Contracting and Payment Services.

In addition to the reduction of Facilities budgets, funding for academic maintenance, Student Life maintenance, and classroom improvement has been reduced by approximately 50% from FY2018 to FY2024.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

A review of benchmarks from relevant organizations reveals that the Facilities team is operating at or below necessary employment levels. For example, the University used Gordian Sightlines, a third-party facilities benchmarking service, to benchmark the University's Facilities operating costs against peer institutions. Our peer institutions spend approximately \$4.62 per gross square foot on facilities operating costs, whereas WVU spends \$0.089 less per gross square foot than its peers. The University has also more maintenance workers and grounds worker FTEs per supervisor than its peers, with WVU supervisors managing over 30% more employees than the industry benchmark of 14 and 16 employees, respectively.

Focusing on a sector of Facilities, as an example, WVU reduced its Facilities maintenance employees approximately 8% from 115 FTEs in FY2018 to 106 FTEs for FY2024. Moreover, the Association of Physical Plant Administrators ("APPA") provides headcount standards relating to maintenance which are generally referred to in the facilities management industry. Generally, the University tries to maintain its facilities at APPA Level 2, which equates to equipment and building components usually being functional and in operating condition with service and maintenance calls responded to in a timely manner. To maintain Level 2, WVU would need 170 FTEs (almost 60 more FTEs) according to APPA standards.

With respect to custodial workers, the University works to maintain a minimum moderate level of cleanliness in our facilities, which equates to APPA Level 3 – Casual Inattention (e.g., bright and clean floors, base moldings, surfaces, light fixtures and bathrooms with no build-up or odor but with possible dust, dirt, stains or streaks). According to APPA's guidelines, the University would need 299 FTEs to maintain Level 3. WVU currently has approximately 231 active FTEs (approximately 70 FTEs less than the benchmark). Finally, with respect to roads and grounds, University roads and grounds employees manage 10% more acres of land per FTE than our peers who manage 22 acres per FTE.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

Facilities maintains our campus at a high level with substantially less FTEs than benchmark standards. Although we are looking at some consolidation of positions between non-Health Sciences Facilities team

members and Health Sciences Facilities team members (mainly supervisory positions), we cannot afford cuts to the Facilities budget without reducing the quality of services provided. Rather, this unit likely will need more resources in the future to continue to maintain this same level of service. In that vein, any savings from reductions of supervisory positions from any potential consolidations would likely be used to increase the hourly rate of our lowest-paid frontline staff members.

Environmental Health and Safety (General University and Health Sciences)

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

Environmental Health and Safety ("EH&S") is responsible for striving to maintain a safe working and learning environment and works on the following safety areas: safety and Health: audits, public health and sanitation, contractor safety and fire and life safety; environmental: stormwater permits and services, hazardous materials, air permitting, SPCC plan, UST/AST inspections and permitting and potable water testing; research Safety: lab safety, biosafety, chemical safety and hygiene, chemical inventory and delivery, protocol review and auditing, research review for safety PPE and lab facilities; emergency Response: spills, fires, floods, unsafe conditions, providing training, accident response, local community outreach and response to athletic games; and other: community outreach, education, training and assisting local governmental agencies.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

In FY2018, EH&S had 18 FTEs compared to 29 FTEs in FY2024 due to the added scope of responsibilities including fire control (5 FTEs), chemical health (4 FTEs) and chemical inventory (2 FTEs). The later increases resulted from recommendations after an internal audit, whereby four chemical health officers were removed from colleges and moved to EH&S, and two chemical inventory employees were added when the University brought its Chemical Inventory System online.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

From a salary and wage perspective, the EH&S budget has increased from \$1.7 million in FY2018 to \$2.1 million in FY2024. EH&S has a very small operational budget of \$150,000 for FY2024, which has steadily declined over previous years. Although EH&S's personnel budget increased in the past five years, this increase was largely transferred from other areas.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

The University reviewed a benchmarking tool from the Campus Safety, Health and Environmental Management Association ("CSHEMA") for calculating environmental health and safety staff and expenditures. The CSHEMA benchmarking tool includes data from 102 institutions and includes data such as student population, employee population, number of buildings, number of laboratories, number of fume hoods, etc. Looking at WVU's data, the CSHEMA tool indicates that WVU's EH&S unit is below average in both funding and number of staff. Additionally, the University compared its EH&S unit to 14 other units at institutions of similar size and determined that the University's EH&S unit is average in size when compared to its peers. When comparing Big 12 peers to WVU's 29 FTEs, Iowa State University has 39, the University of Texas has 40, and the University of Central Florida has 21.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

EH&S provides critical safety services for our University and especially our researchers. As indicated above, the EH&S unit is below FTEs based upon national benchmarks and in line with FTE size compared to our institutional peers. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its budget without reducing the quality of services provided. If investment opportunities become available, this unit would like to add some additional FTEs to assist with strategic projects.

Procurement, Contracting and Payment Services

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

Procurement, Contracting and Payment Services ("PCPS") is responsible for driving savings, convenience and efficiency into the purchasing and payment of goods and services for University customers, including: sourcing suppliers in compliance with the West Virginia Code; paying suppliers in accordance with the West Virginia Code and within the controls approved by the State Auditor; registering suppliers; managing systems and processes to enable and properly control University spend; managing supplier contracts, driving contract compliance and managing supplier risk; managing user-facing procurement systems, conducting user training and resolving issues; managing Unifier work order management system, conducting user training and resolving issues; operating warehouses to purchase, store and distribute items for use by WVU for facilities repairs, cleaning, maintenance and operations; disposing of surplus items no longer needed; and operating the mail room.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

In 2021, warehouse services and ABS systems moved from Facilities to PCPS, adding 12 FTEs to headcount and approximately \$594,000 in budget. As a result, PCPS has a current FTE count of 53 FTEs, up from FY2018 when there were 41 FTEs.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

From a salary and wage perspective, the PCPS personnel budget has declined from \$2.63 million in FY2018 to \$2.57 million in FY2024 (excluding warehouse services and ABS systems).

PCPS has a very small non-personnel operating budget of \$72,756 for FY2024, which is consistent with previous years. PCPS savings by far offset the cost of the department through negotiations with suppliers. For example, PCPS's recent negotiation with Dell reduced the cost of the University's laptops and desktops by over 15%.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

The West Virginia Code requires that PCPS be audited every three years. In March 2023, an independent, third-party audit made the following conclusions about PCPS:

"In many regards, PCPS operates as a highly effective organization, adhering to or exceeding many industries best practices and exceeding performance and accountability standards in a number of areas."

"Staffing levels are appropriate and were not determined to be a factor in performance. However, vacancies in some positions, especially supplier governance, are impacting the ability to further implement desired programs and oversight."

Additionally, the University used metrics developed by the Hackett Group to measure the PCPS organization and notes the following:

The cross-industry peer group on average spends 0.55% of spend on procurement with best-in-class spend of approximately 0.43%, yet WVU only spends 0.37% of its spend on procurement; and

The cross-industry peer group has 60 FTEs per \$1 billion in procurement spend with best-in-class having 42.4 FTEs per \$1 billion in procurement spend, yet WVU only has 33 FTEs per \$1 billion in spend.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

PCPS performs important services for the University and through its work has assisted the University in decreasing its spend on key supplies and services through strategic sourcing. As indicated above, PCPS is below FTEs based on national benchmarks. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its budget without reducing the quality of the services provided. If investment opportunities become available, this unit would like to add one to two FTEs to assist in certain strategic and governance projects as indicated in the recent third-party independent audit.

Planning, Design, Construction and Scheduling

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Planning, Design, Construction and Scheduling ("PDCS") team assists faculty, staff and students with quality design services, enhancing the campus environment where people work, learn, study, recreate and collaborate through: campus and capital project planning; space planning; interior design; classroom scheduling; capital project design; and capital project construction management.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

PDCS has a current FTE count of 21 FTEs for FY2024, which is a decline from 37 FTEs in FY2018.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

From a salary and wage perspective, the overall PDCS budget has increased from \$799,000 in FY2018 to \$1.1 million in FY2024 due to salary increases from the most recent University pay raise programs as well as correctly allocating the pay for a senior Facilities leader to this team that was previously budgeted elssewhere.

The PDCS operations budget in FY2018 was \$121,000 and decreased to \$117,000 for FY2024. Additionally, funding for maintenance of the Montgomery campus was added to this group, adding \$586,000, which was not previously budgeted.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

Planning and Scheduling has less staff on average when compared to Big 12 and area peers including Penn State, University of Pittsburgh, Virginia Tech and Ohio State. For example, the average peer had at least 4 space management FTEs and 4 campus planner FTEs, compared with 2 FTEs in each area for WVU.

Construction and Design Services remains less expensive than current local market rates for similar functions and is completely self-funded in the sense that it covers salaries and expenses by charging an administrative fee for the work it performs.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

In conclusion, PDCS is largely a self-funded unit. As indicated above, PDCS has less FTEs compared to its Big 12 and regional peers. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its budget without reducing the quality of the services provided. If investment opportunities become available, this unit would like to add 1-2 FTEs to assist in certain space planning needs.

Parking

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Parking team assists faculty, staff and students with everything from purchasing a parking pass to exploring alternative transportation for getting around campus, as follows: issuing permits and resolving citations; maintaining and upgrading parking lots; enforcing rules and regulations; undertaking revenue collection and reconciliation; and maintaining pay stations and gates.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

Parking has held a steady FTE count of 14 FTEs from FY2018 to FY2024.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

From a salary and wage perspective, the overall Parking budget has declined from \$997,000 in FY2018 to \$685,000 in FY2024. The Parking expense budget in FY2018 was \$3.2 million and declined to \$2.6 million in FY2024. Additionally, other than beginning to charge a small fee for parking at the WVU Coliseum, the University has not increased its parking rates in more than ten years.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

The University regularly benchmarks parking costs against comparable parking rates in Morgantown, and WVU remains competitive from a rate perspective. For example, short-term lots in Morgantown generally range from \$0.75 to \$1.25 per hour, while WVU short-term rates range from \$1.25 to \$1.50 per hour, reflecting premium locations. Staffing benchmarks for parking are challenging to find without subscriptions or fees. However, compared to the available 2015 Parking Analytics Survey, parking.org reported that:

The average university revenue per parking office FTE is \$214,000 in parking revenues brought in per FTE. In 2022, WVU was at \$308,000 in parking revenues brought in per FTE (approximately 25% higher).

The number of parking spaces per parking office FTE was 643. In 2022, the University had 712 (approximately 10% higher).

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

In conclusion, Parking is largely a self-funded unit (through parking fees), with competitive rates and what we believe to be appropriate levels of staffing. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its budget without reducing the quality of the services provided and the revenue earned.

Transportation

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Transportation team assists faculty, staff and students in traveling across campus, as follows: operating the PRT; operating University bus services; operating the University's accessibility shuttle; and managing the University fleet.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

Transportation has a current FTE count of 51 FTEs for FY2024, which is a decline from 55 FTEs in FY2018.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

From a salary and wage perspective, the overall Transportation budget has declined from \$3.1 million in FY2018 to \$2.6 million in FY2024. The Transportation expense budget in FY2018 was \$7.8 million and declined to \$6.6 million for FY2024.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

The Transportation team has reduced its small vehicle fleet by 115 vehicles since 2021, a reduction of 23%. Of those reductions, 70% were from central operations and 30% were from the colleges. The rpkGroup recently reviewed the University's fleet and recommended the implementation of a University-wide fleet policy to further reduce the fleet. The rpkGroup also recommended the following: establish a comprehensive fleet inventory system; reduce the vehicle fleet by leveraging leasing or other care share services to reduce institutional investment in vehicles; and implement a shared motor pool.

Additionally, WVU is exploring the outsourcing of its fleet to third-party companies, including the purchase, management, maintenance and disposition of the vehicles. An RFP for these services will launch early next year. The RFP will provide a strong cost benchmark against which to compare WVU's fleet operations, and we hope will result in long-term savings to the University

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

Transportation provides important services for our University. As indicated in the review provided by rpkGroup, this unit is understaffed and under-resourced. This unit likely will need more resources in the future to continue to maintain this same level of service as it is currently structured. That said, we are exploring outsourcing the motor pool to see if that would be more cost-effective and allow for upgraded vehicles and buses. However, even if it is determined that it would be more cost effective to outsource motor pool operations, the PRT vehicles are still in need of substantial investments for necessary upgrades.

Sustainability

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Sustainability unit is responsible for leading the University's efforts to ensure a more sustainable future for its students, faculty and staff and for the citizens of West Virginia, including: surplus management, recycling, service-learning opportunities; sustainable grounds collaboration, alternative transportation development; procurement contract evaluation; sustainable dining operations; and serving as a voice for increased sustainability activity in energy procurement, cleaning chemical and paper products, IT purchasing, campus printing, building energy and water efficiency and vehicle fleet reduction.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The Sustainability unit has a current FTE count of two FTEs, the same as FY2018.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

From a salary and wage perspective, the overall Sustainability budget has increased from \$139,000 in FY2018 to \$149,000 in FY2024 due to salary increases from the most recent University pay raise program.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

WVU has fewer employees focusing on Sustainability than its peer institutions. For example, the University of Pittsburgh has four FTEs and seven student employees as part of its sustainability team.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

In conclusion, Sustainability is a small unit with less FTEs in comparison to our peers. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its budget without reducing the quality of the services provided.

Division of Finance

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Division of Finance is responsible for Institutional Accounting, Reporting, and Analysis, Administrative Financial Planning, Budget Planning, Payroll, Risk Management and Insurance, Financial Projects and Compliance, Tax Services, Treasury Operations and more. Much like ABS, the Division of Finance is critical to the ongoing operations of the University and should continue, with a focus on regular and routine KPIs and increased transparency and engagement on financial matters with the institution.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The Finance unit has 47 FTEs for FY2024, which is a decrease from 102 FTEs in FY2018. These reductions are due, in part, to the implementation and transfer of employees to the Shared Services unit.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

The Finance salary and wages decreased by 39%, or \$2.8 million, from FY2018 to FY2024. Finance has a small operating budget of \$156,000 for FY2024, which is a 75% decrease from the FY2018 budget of \$615,000.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

When looking at similar Big 12 schools, the Finance staff at each school is comparable when looking at Finance staff per student, which is about .002 staff per enrolled student. With enrollment of approximately 25,000 students that would equate to 50 finance FTEs. At 47 FTEs, WVU is below the benchmark identified.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The Finance department size is very comparable to other peer universities and has decreased in size and dollar amount since FY2018. In addition, given the future projects requiring significant manpower, such as the new ERP implementation, our evaluation concluded that the Finance department is very lean. If investment opportunities become available, this unit would like to add one to two FTEs to assist in these significant upcoming financial and budgetary projects.

Shared Services

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The WVU Shared Services Center ("SSC") provides support related to payroll, benefits, externally funded awards, employment funding information and more through Customer Care, Workforce Administration, Financial Management and Sponsored-Project Financial Management, and Operational Excellence. Several years ago, WVU moved to a shared services model following an analysis showing that the University could reduce costs and streamline business processes by moving from a decentralized to a more centralized model.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The Shared Services unit has 123 FTEs for FY2024, which is a decrease from 129 FTEs in FY2020. This headcount comparison does not include the additional reduction of 6 FTEs in February of 2024 as part of the Shared Services / Talent and Culture restructuring.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

The SSC opened its doors on Jan. 27, 2020. Prior to the opening of the SSC, transactional work and support were handled in units all over the University and incorporated as part of those units' budgets at the time. Requests for support and processing of transactions were made in various ways and by many people, but they were not all tracked. Many of these needs remained segregated by unit and were not known by our central units.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

According to the original implementation plan, the SSC has never been considered fully staffed and has adjusted its personnel and workload accordingly as the financial and human resources transactional work has been fine-tuned and adjusted in the last three years. An external consultant recommended approximately 175 FTEs to open and begin operating the shared services at the University. This number was suggested as a starting point for staffing. The external consultants felt that we could scale the SSC FTE number back after we had technology upgrades in place. Without the upgrades, 175 FTEs would be needed to handle a great deal of manual work outside of the current financial system. In short, it has never been fully staffed to the level recommended by the external consultants.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The SSC is a large unit handling thousands of financial transactions each year, many of which could be handled in the future through updated technology. Following the evaluation, the FTE levels will continue to be reviewed and adjusted as the transactional work reduces relating to academic and programmatic changes. It will adjust even more with the future planned implementation of technology and other tools as a part of the Modernization Program.

Strategic Partnerships

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

Strategic Partnerships governs and provides collaborative oversight for key partnerships and vendor relationship management including WVU Dining Services powered by Sodexo, the WVU bookstores in partnership with Barnes and Noble on the Morgantown, Beckley and Keyser campuses, and the Erickson Alumni Center. This unit also develops consistent marketing and communication strategy and support for Finance, Auxiliary and Business Services, Dining Services, Legal, Government and Collaborative Relations, Talent and Culture, University Police, and other administrative units as necessary in coordination with the University Relations office.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

First, a team of three individuals are responsible for the oversight and strategic planning, partnership, and development of objectives as it relates to WVU's contract for dining services on the Morgantown, Beckley and Keyser campuses by overseeing the contract governance, analyzing and interpreting financial data to include forecasting and benchmarking as well as nutritional guidance and counseling. These positions are funded through the revenues generated by the contract. The WVU Dining Services unit detailed review is below.

Second, Strategic Partnerships is responsible for the direction, oversight and management of the bookstores (three on the Morgantown campus and one in both Beckley and Keyser) while reviewing partnership opportunities to enhance the student and faculty experience through new business offerings and innovative solutions to meet current needs and trends. There are not any 100% dedicated FTEs working on this collaborative partnership.

Third, this unit also oversees the strategic planning, partnership, governance, revenue generation and development of objectives as it relates to the Erickson Alumni Center and leads all aspects of the strategic property management and the guest experience for the Erickson Alumni Center – a 48,000 square foot, marque, multi-purpose events facility with institution-wide impact. A small team of six FTEs manages the day-to-day operations of the facility and are all funded through the revenue from sales and services of the facility. The FTE count has been reduced by two since the University began the oversight of the facility in 2021. The Erickson is financially self-sufficient and is on track to make a profit for this current FY.

Finally, two FTEs, down from four FTEs in FY2023, work in this unit to develop consistent marketing and communication strategy and support for Finance, Auxiliary and Business Services, Dining Services, Legal, Government and Collaborative Relations, Talent and Culture, University Police, and other administrative units as necessary in coordination with the University Relations office. The director-level communications and marketing position as well as a communications specialist position were non-renewed and/or not replaced in FY2023.

View unit budget comparison, benchmarks and review outcome for Strategic Partnerships sub-units below.

Dining Services

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

Dining Services is committed to providing balanced, flavorful meals and offering students the resources to achieve their nutritional and wellness goals. The Dining Services unit offers a variety of dining plans, locations and meal options that meet student, faculty and staff needs through residential, retail and catering dining options. Dining Services is an essential part of the University and serves our campus community, especially students residing in residence halls.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

Following the decision to hire Sodexo as a contract manager for Dining Services in 2018, the University's Dining Services unit that is responsible for managing the Sodexo agreement operates with 3 FTEs

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

The University's Dining Services unit that is responsible for managing the Sodexo agreement operates with an operational budget of approximately \$174,000 in FY2024.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

In response to a request for operational information through members of the National Association of Colleges & Universities Food Services ("NACUFS"), of those institutions that responded and have dining contracts with a third-party operator, WVU has fewer employees focusing on Dining than peer institutions. Even in instances where institutions have lower enrollment, fewer retail operations or residential dining halls, WVU has fewer FTEs dedicated to Dining.

INSTITUTION	# OF FTES	# OF DIETITIANS	# OF RESIDENTIAL DINING HALLS	# OF RETAIL OPS	ENROLLMENT
Alabama	8	2	2	33	39,623
George Washington	4	1	3	6	11,500
UNC Charlotte	2	2	2	23	29,000
U of Washington St. Louis	13	4.5	3	14	7,803
WVU	2	1	5	21	27,367

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The Dining Services team of three runs a very lean operation that manages critical student and campus food services that are open seven days a week and hold hours of operation outside of traditional business hours to provide three meals a day. The bandwidth of the current team is stretched thin and, without additional FTEs, cannot increase operational support and service without compromising quality.

Information Technology Services (General University and Health Sciences)

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

Information Technology Services ("ITS") supports platforms that enrich learning and enhance the digital experience for students, faculty and staff. They also protect individual privacy, maintain data integrity and secure intellectual property. The ITS team is essential to the University and needs to continue with additional investment when available. The ITS team operates by: supporting personalized student experiences with platforms that can enrich learning and enhance the digital experience for Gen Z and beyond; unlocking the data in WVU's institutional silos to inform decision-making that can support educational excellence, enable meaningful research and encourage innovation; continuously improving security and risk management processes to protect individual privacy, maintain data integrity and secure intellectual property; creating a modern IT organization that can meet the needs of the enterprise, with a collaborative governance structure to guide direction and prioritize initiatives; creating capacity for faculty and staff by automating administrative processes where possible, improving efficiency and outcomes; and developing a sustainable, long-term financial model for core technologies and underlying infrastructure, ensuring they are available on demand, well-maintained and flexible enough to accommodate future needs.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The ITS unit has 208 FTEs for FY2024, which is a decrease from 233 FTEs in FY2018. In 2023, ITS and Health Sciences ITS merged into one unit. The initial organizational changes and position eliminations are complete, and we continue to explore opportunities for greater efficiency. We are currently merging the Classroom Technology team from the Teaching and Learning Commons into ITS.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

The ITS expense budget in FY2018 was \$10.3 million and declined to \$6.7 million in FY2024. The University needs to identify additional sources of investment for the University's IT infrastructure and Information Security Program.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

We explored benchmarking FTE count against other universities using EDUCAUSE data but found it difficult to identify appropriate benchmark universities. There are several factors to consider, including organizational structure, functions included in IT, size and complexity of the research portfolio, size and complexity of the academic medical center, and the degree of IT centralization. The data does not provide insight into the efficiency of the IT organizations, making it difficult to determine if the benchmark organizations are understaffed or overstaffed. Consequently, ITS is working on a series of key performance indicators that we believe will more effectively measure the performance of the organization.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The ITS unit is under-resourced. It is also understaffed for the demand in some areas like information security, Salesforce, and research services with the added difficulty of its current salaries for ITS personnel being below market. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its personnel and operations budget without eliminating services or reducing the quality of existing services provided. Rather, this unit needs immediate investments to continue to function appropriately.

Office of General Counsel

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Office of General Counsel ("OGC") strives to be problem solvers, defend the interests of the University, protect and promote the integrity of the University and provide quality legal services, advice and guidance to the University community in support of the University's overarching goals, objectives and mission.

Legal serves as in-house legal counsel for West Virginia University; West Virginia University Potomac State College; West Virginia University Institute of Technology; West Virginia University Robert C. Byrd Health Sciences Center, including the Martinsburg and Charleston divisions; West Virginia University Research Corporation; West Virginia University Innovation Corporation; and WVU Extension Offices.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The Office of General Counsel had 12 FTEs in FY2018 and currently has 14 FTEs. One FTE was added to perform the federally required Clery Act compliance functions. The other FTE was added when a high-level attorney left, and their position was split into two entry-level positions.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

In FY2018, OGC had an operating budget of \$110,000, and in FY2024, the OGC operating budget is \$100,000.

OCG's personnel budget for FY2024 is \$2.15 million; it has increased from \$1.7 million in FY2018 due to salary increases from the recent University pay raise programs. In 2022, the National Association of College and University Attorneys ("NACUA") conducted a benchmarking survey of its members. Based on these benchmarks, the lawyers within the Office of General Counsel are paid below the average salaries of lawyers in other university general counsel offices with similar experience levels.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

Moreover, based on the NACUA benchmarks, the Office of General Counsel has fewer or similar FTEs than our peers. For example, the average FTEs in a General Counsel office for doctorate-granting universities is 14.6 (similar to WVU), and the average FTEs in a General Counsel office in a university with 25,000 to 34,999 student enrollment is 15.8 (almost two more than WVU). However, the average FTEs in the General Counsel office for universities with an institutional budget of more than \$1 billion is 25.9 FTEs (almost 11 more than WVU). Additionally, many of these institutions not only have the FTEs within their general counsel office but also additional lawyers available in a university system-level office. For example, the University of Texas at Austin has 13 FTEs in its office, but the University of Texas system legal office has an additional 50+ FTEs in its office.

Additionally, OGC's outside counsel budget has averaged \$1.6 million per year over the last six years. The outside counsel budget for FY2024 is \$1.5 million. According to the NACUA benchmark survey data, this outside counsel budget is less than or similar to our peers. For example, the average outside counsel budget for doctorate-granting universities is \$1.6 million (similar to WVU); the average outside counsel budget for a university with 25,000 to 34,999 student enrollment is \$2 million (\$500,000 more than WVU); and the average outside counsel budget for a university with an institutional budget of more than \$1 billion is \$2.9 million (\$1.4 million more than WVU).

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The Office of General Counsel performs important services for the University. As indicated above, OGC is below FTEs and has a smaller outside counsel budget in comparison to institutional peers. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its budget without reducing the quality of the services provided. If investment opportunities become available, the Office of General Counsel would advocate for the addition of one lawyer and one paralegal to assist with existing workload and ensure that the OGC team can continue to efficiently provide legal services at the same level that its clients have come to expect.

Real Estate Operations

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

Real Estate Operations oversees the real estate functions of WVU, including all campuses and various other locations (e.g., Jackson's Mill and WVU Extension offices), and the WVU Research Corporation. The unit is responsible for the granting and acquiring of easements, the acquisition and conveyance of property, the preparation of key Facility Use Agreements, property management and leasing.

A leasing and transactional team of two and a half FTEs carries out a variety of discreet administrative functions including the management of more than 200 leases on behalf of WVU colleges, departments, and research units. By comparison, the West Virginia Division of Real Estate manages between 450 and 475 leases with a staff of nine FTEs; provides strategic planning and management of WVU's commercial properties; management of WVU's cellular portfolio, which includes site license agreements for towers, rooftop systems, distributed antenna system(s) and related ancillary structures; utilizes a GIS (Geographic Information System) for reporting, tracking and managing WVU's real property assets, mineral interests, leases and other chain of title documents (e.g. deed documents); provides mapping services to the administrative units of WVU; and coordination of leases and real estate transactions between WVU and WVURC's related and affiliated entities (e.g., WVU Foundation and WVU Medicine).

Another team of seven FTE manages the daily operations of WVU's four residential apartment communities, commonly called University Apartments, consisting of over 800 units/1693 beds on the Morgantown campus. Three of the four residential communities are components of separate and uniquely structured public-private partnerships. This team works with other WVU departments (e.g., Student Life and Facilities Management) and, where applicable, their respective private partners to ensure that each community operates efficiently and remains clean, safe, and secure.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The Real Estate Operations unit has 9.5 FTEs for FY2024, which is a decrease from 14 FTEs in FY2018.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

Real Estate Operations does not have a specific operating budget independent from the Office of General Counsel; however, through the new budgeting model, efforts are underway to establish an operating budget specific to its unit.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

The Real Estate leasing and transactional team is understaffed by at least three FTEs when comparing it to units that carry out similar functions at other R1 land-grant institutions. For example, the real estate units of Oregon State University, Penn State University and Washington State University have six FTEs, five FTEs and six FTEs, respectively. Additionally, Virginia Commonwealth University, a regional R1 peer institution, has five FTEs in its real estate unit.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The Real Estate unit performs important services for the University. As indicated above, the Real Estate unit is below FTEs in comparison to its peers and state-level benchmarks. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its personnel budget without reducing the quality of the services provided. If investment opportunities become available, this unit would like to add one to two FTEs to assist in certain strategic projects.

Talent and Culture

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Talent and Culture unit attracts and retains a talented workforce at WVU. Prior to its recent restructuring, Talent and Culture consisted of six units: 1.Benefits and Compensation: Provides strategic management of the full employee benefits portfolio and designs, develops and manages strategic planning for the University's employee classifications and compensation structure; 2.Employee Relations: Manages employee discipline, investigations (Title IX and Rule 1.6), and Code of Conduct matters for classified and non-classified staff; manages all Title IX, Rule 1.6 and Code of Conduct investigations involving faculty; manages the employee performance review process; and manages all medical management and FMLA claims; 3.Human Resources Partners ("HRPs"): Provide HR strategic/project support to non-academic leaders and their departments and work collaboratively with leaders to determine the needs of the department; 4.Talent Strategy: Serves as a resource for leaders for all recruitment strategy, process questions and support including development of job description, request to hire, search process, search committee support, recruitment, interview, offer and onboarding; 5.Leadership and Organizational Development: Provides training and leadership development opportunities for all WVU employees; and 6.Operations: Manages employee appreciation and recognition, HR policies and procedures and handles all special projects.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The Talent and Culture unit has 65 FTEs for FY2024 compared to 70 FTEs in FY2018. It has a personnel budget of \$6.5 million for FY2024.

Additionally, Talent and Culture has decreased the number of director-level positions from seven directors to six directors in FY2024. The Talent and Culture operational expense budget in FY2018 was \$515,000 and declined to \$265,000 in FY2024.

Despite the past decrease in FTEs and operational budget in Talent and Culture over the past six years, there is more work that can be done to reduce costs. We are currently evaluating restructuring opportunities. Based upon our review to date, we estimate a decrease in FTEs of approximately ten, which would result in a budget savings of approximately \$500,000. This evaluation should be completed in February. This budget savings is inclusive of hiring an AVP of Talent and Culture to operationally and strategically oversee the newly restructured unit.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

Despite the past decrease in FTEs and operational budget in Talent and Culture over the past six years, there is more work that can be done to reduce costs. As a result of these administrative unit reviews, a re-structuring of Talent & Culture was announced on February 21, 2024.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

Despite the past decrease in FTEs and operational budget in Talent and Culture over the past six years, there is more work that can be done to reduce costs. As a result of these administrative unit reviews, a re-structuring of Talent & Culture was announced on February 21, 2024.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The HR Partner and Talent Strategy teams are being restructured and will be renamed to better reflect their missions for our employees. With a few exceptions, most of the current positions on both of these teams have been eliminated and will be replaced by fewer, more focused positions.

The Strategic HR Partners will be tasked with clearly understanding and aligning their work with the overall strategic vision and goals of the leaders and units that they support, as well as the larger University, and we hope their renewed focus will better aid our University leaders.

Moreover, during our discussions, the Shared Services Center and Talent Strategy leaders agreed to restructure our teams to create greater efficiencies within our hiring process and ensure we are providing a consistent, reliable process for all prospective and new employees. We will be moving strategic recruitment activities for all position types from the Shared Services Center to the new Talent Acquisition and Recruitment team, including sourcing, candidate assessment and candidate engagement. The administrative tasks related to recruitment will remain in the Shared Services Center and include creating requisitions, posting positions, launching background checks, issuing offer letters and onboarding. We will be creating a new team in the Workforce Administration unit of Shared Services that will be called Recruitment System Support and Payroll Processing.

In addition, the Leadership and Organizational Development, Medical Management and Projects and Operations teams will also be restructured to better serve their constituents. We have not made changes to the Benefits and Compensation team.

These changes will result in a net reduction of 11 FTEs (between Talent & Culture and Shared Services) and over \$500,000 in savings to the University.

University Police Department

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The University Police Department ("UPD") is committed to serving our campus and providing a safe environment for students, faculty, staff and visitors, including: patrolling campus, cooperative zones and public-private partnership areas; undertaking criminal and administrative investigations; providing security, such as staffing at special events and dignitary protection; providing programming and training to officers as well as our campus community; creating and maintaining Emergency Management plans and procedures, including K-9 unit services; providing parking, traffic and pedestrian safety support; and participating in the regional drug task force and collaborating with other law enforcement agencies.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

UPD has 66 FTEs for FY2024, which is a decrease from 69 in FY2018.

In April 2018, UPD had a total of 52 sworn officers. Currently, UPD has 39 sworn officers. UPD has four open officer positions that it is seeking to fill and recently hired two new individuals to bring the unit to a total of 44 sworn officers. In short, five years ago, the University had eight more sworn police officers budgeted. UPD is also prioritizing having front-line officers instead of command staff. As an example, a command staff member recently retired. Instead of replacing that position, UPD took that salary and used it to hire two entry-level officer positions.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

UPD's personnel budget for FY2018 was \$4.1 million compared to \$4.9 million for FY2024. This increase ensured that officers are paid competitively in comparison to other agencies within the Morgantown area. That said, although UPD's salary offerings are competitive from an hourly rate standpoint, a significant number of agencies that compete for qualified law enforcement officers (such as the West Virginia State Police, Monongalia County Sheriff's Office and the City of Morgantown) offer their officers a defined benefit in the form of a pension. As a result, UPD has had a difficult time maintaining an officer past 3-5 years of experience. These officers typically move to an agency that offers a pension retirement plan.

UPD has seen a decline in its operational budget declining from \$426,000 in FY2018 to \$384,000 for FY2024. This decrease has led to difficulties in ensuring that necessary police equipment is timely and appropriately replaced when it reaches its end of useful life.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

WVU reports a similar total number of crimes on the Annual Security and Fire Safety Report (2018-2022) as its regional peers but has a significantly lower number of sworn police officers. For example, the University of Pittsburgh has 100 officers and Penn State has 64.

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

In conclusion, the UPD unit is under-resourced and understaffed. Despite having fewer students, the overall need for officers has increased as the request for services that UPD provides like welfare checks have also increased and the overall responsibility of the cooperative zone. It also has the additional difficulty of not offering a competitive retirement package compared to other regional police agencies. Following this evaluation, we concluded that this unit cannot afford to cut its personnel and operations budget without reducing the quality of the services it provides. Rather, this unit needs immediate investments to continue to function appropriately. The University is currently working through a plan to increase funding to UPD for FY2025.

Government and Corporate Relations

UNIT SUMMARY AND RESPONSIBILITY:

The Government Relations team represents WVU and cultivates connections with federal, state, regional, and local policymakers that support and advance the mission of WVU on behalf of students, faculty and staff by: working with WVU stakeholders to develop policy positions that reflect the interest of WVU; developing and maintaining relationships with local, state and federal delegations; partnering with local, state, regional and federal economic development offices; communicating with students, faculty and staff; and navigating, both internally and externally, agencies and policymakers for WVU and WVU for policymakers and their constituents.

The Corporate Relations unit is the industry's gateway to WVU. The team builds and strengthens mutually beneficial relationships with U.S. and global businesses. They also align WVU's resources and expertise with business priorities that positively impact WVU students, faculty and staff. Impact areas include: research; recruitment; campus engagement; and university advancement.

UNIT HEAD COUNT COMPARISON:

The Government and Corporate Relations unit has four FTEs for FY2024, which is a decrease from six employees in FY2018.

UNIT BUDGET COMPARISON:

The operating budget for FY2024 is \$211,000. This is a \$15,000 reduction from the last fiscal year. The FY2018 operating budget was incorporated into an overall budget of the then-Vice President for Strategic Initiatives and therefore not available for comparison.

UNIT BENCHMARKS:

This unit has fewer FTEs and has a smaller operating budget in comparison to similar-sized institutions with related missions (like Virginia Tech, a land grant institution with seven government relations officers, representing a university with comparable total enrollment and statewide mission).

CONCLUSION STATEMENT / REVIEW OUTCOME:

The Government and Corporate Relations unit performs important services for the University by building and maintaining relationships while strategically partnering and collaborating with internal and external entities and stakeholders. Further reductions to this unit would significantly impair the University's partnerships with federal, state, regional and local officials. The unit plans to focus on and kick off a collaborative effort in the spring which will seek to reach internal and external partners and address ways to better work together and maximize partnerships and opportunities. Any further reductions would significantly affect this plan.

Analysis of Director-Level and Above Positions

The Faculty Senate has also asked the administrative units to compare current and previous levels of director-level and above positions. On an apples-to-apples basis, the units that previously were organized under Strategic Initiatives and the OGC are down eight director-level positions compared to FY2018, when including the elimination of the Vice President for Strategic Initiatives and the Vice President for Talent and Culture positions. The following is a summary of the director-level and above positions within Strategic Initiatives units over the past five years:

- Auxiliary and Business Services: Compared to 2018, ABS has the same number of director-level and above positions.
- **Dining Services:** Compared to 2018, Dining Services has one less FTE at the director level and above and currently has a Director of Dining position.
- Corporate and Government Relations: Compared to 2018, Corporate and Government Relations has two less FTEs at the director level and above.
- **Finance:** Compared to 2018, Finance has one more FTE at the director level and above. When the Chief Budget Officer position became vacant last year, the University promoted the Chief Budget Officer of HSC and did not backfill that position.
- Talent and Culture: Compared to 2018, Talent and Culture has two less FTE at the director level and above.
- Real Estate: The Director of Real Estate position was eliminated in 2019 and was briefly replaced by a Director of Property Management until 2020; the Deputy General Counsel now handles all real estate matters.
- Strategic Initiatives: The position of Vice President and two director-level and above positions have been eliminated, down two from 2018. There is one remaining director level and above position. The Office of Strategic Initiatives has been eliminated. The remaining director level and above position is now the Associate Vice President of Strategic Partnerships and oversees the bookstore and dining contracts, the Erickson Alumni Center and marketing and communications efforts for Finance, Auxiliary and Business Services, Legal, Talent and Culture, University Police, Erickson Alumni Center and other administrative units.
- **University Police Department:** UPD had five members in its command staff in FY2018 and now has four members in its command staff.
- Office of General Counsel: The Office of General Counsel had one General Counsel and four Deputy General Counsels in FY2018. This remains the same today.
- Shared Services: Shared Services is a unit created in 2020 with six director-level or above positions. In FY2022, the SSC made an organizational change to combine units within the Shared Services Center. The Director of Financial Management position was eliminated, and the duties were assumed under the Director of Financial Management and Sponsored Projects (formerly called Director of Sponsored Projects Financial Management).
- Information Technology Services: Compared to 2018, ITS has 2 more director-level positions and 6 fewer assistant directors due to the merger of the overall ITS and HSC ITS units